



**CITY OF WEST COVINA**

**PLANNING COMMISSION**

**SEPTEMBER 22, 2020, 7:00 PM  
REGULAR MEETING**

**CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1444 W. GARVEY AVENUE SOUTH  
WEST COVINA, CALIFORNIA 91790**

**Sheena Heng, Chair  
Don Holtz, Vice Chair  
Gregory Jaquez, Commissioner  
Glenn Kennedy, Commissioner  
Herb Redholtz, Commissioner**

On March 4, 2020, Governor Newsom proclaimed a State of Emergency in California as a result of the threat of COVID-19. On March 17, 2020, Governor Newsom issued Executive Order N-29-20, suspending certain requirements of the Brown Act relating to the conduct of public meetings. Pursuant to the Executive Orders, Planning Commissioners may attend Planning Commission meetings telephonically and the Planning Commission is not required to make available a physical location from which members of the public may observe the meeting and offer public comment.

On June 18, 2020, the California Department of Public Health issued guidance mandating that people in California wear cloth face coverings in specified circumstances, including when they are inside of, or in line to enter, any indoor public space.

Due to the ongoing COVID-19 emergency and pursuant to State and County public health directives, the City Council Chambers will have limited seating available on a first-come, first-served basis for members of the public to attend and participate in the Planning Commission meeting in person. All persons attending the meeting are required to wear cloth face coverings and observe social distancing protocols.

Members of the public may also watch Planning Commission the meeting live on the City's website at: <https://www.westcovina.org/departments/city-clerk/agendas-and-meetings/current-meetings-and-agendas> under the "Watch Live" tab or through the West Covina City YouTube channel at [www.westcovina.org/LIVE](http://www.westcovina.org/LIVE).

If you are experiencing symptoms such as fever or chills, cough, shortness of breath or difficulty breathing, fatigue, or sore throat, the City requests that you participate in the meeting from home by watching the meeting live via the links set forth above.

REMOTE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION: In lieu of attending the meeting in person, members of the public can submit public comments via email or address the Planning Commission by telephone using the methods described below.

EMAILED PUBLIC COMMENT: Members of the public can submit public comments to the City Clerk via e-mail at City\_Clerk@westcovina.org. The subject line should specify either “Oral Communications or Public Hearing – 9/22/20”. Please include your full name and address in your e-mail. All emails received by 4:00 P.M. on the day of the Commission meeting will be posted to the City’s website under “Current Meetings and Agendas” and provided to the Planning Commission prior to the meeting. No comments will be read out loud during the meeting. All comments received will be made part of the official public record of the meeting.

TELEPHONIC ACCESSIBILITY: Members of the public that wish to address the Planning Commission by telephone during Oral Communications or a public hearing may contact the City Clerk by email City\_Clerk@westcovina.org or by telephone (626) 939-8433 by 5:30 P.M. on the day of the Commission meeting for instructions regarding addressing the Planning Commission by telephone during the meeting.

***Please turn off all cell phones and other electronic devices prior to entering the Council Chambers***

#### **AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT**

The City complies with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA). If you will need special assistance at Planning Commission meetings, please call (626) 939-8433 (voice) or (626) 960-4422 (TTY) from 8 to 5 Monday through Thursday. Do call at least one day prior to the meeting date to inform us of your particular needs and to determine if accommodation is possible. For sign language interpreter services at Planning Commission meetings, please request no less than four working days prior to the meeting.

#### **PUBLIC COMMENTS/ADDRESSING THE COMMISSION**

Any person wishing to address the Planning Commission on any matter listed on the agenda or on any other matter within their jurisdiction is asked to complete a speaker card that is provided on the speaker podium and submit the card to a Planning Department staff member.

***Please identify on the speaker card whether you are speaking on an agenda item or non-agenda item.*** Requests to speak on non-agenda items will be heard during “Oral Communications” before the Public Hearing section of the agenda. Oral Communications are limited to thirty (30) minutes. Generally, comments are limited to five minutes per speaker unless further time is granted by the Chairperson. ***The Chairperson may also, at his or her discretion, further limit the time of each speaker in order to accommodate a large number of speakers and/or to ensure that the business of the Planning Commission is effectively conducted.***

Any testimony or comments regarding a matter set for Public Hearing will be heard during the public hearing for that item.

Next Resolution No. 20-6045

#### **MOMENT OF SILENT PRAYER/MEDITATION**

#### **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

#### **ROLL CALL**

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

1. Regular meeting, August 25, 2020

## **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

This is the time when any member of the public may speak to the Commission on any matter within the scope of duties assigned to the Commission relating to non-agendized or consent calendar items. Other matters included on this agenda may be addressed when that item is under consideration. For all oral communications, the chairperson may impose reasonable limitations on public comments to assure an orderly and timely meeting. The Ralph M. Brown Act limits the Planning Commission and staff's ability to respond to public comments at this meeting. Thus, your comments may be agendized for a future meeting or referred to staff. The Commission may ask questions for clarification, if desired, at this time.

By policy of the Commission, Oral Communications at this time on the agenda is limited to a total of 15 minutes. Persons who are not afforded the opportunity to speak at this time may do so under "Continuation of Oral Communications" later on the agenda.

## **PUBLIC HEARINGS**

2. **ADMINISTRATIVE USE PERMIT NO. 17-15**  
**SUBCOMMITTEE FOR DESIGN REVIEW NO. 17-27**  
**TREE REMOVAL PERMIT NO. 20-09**  
**CATEGORICAL EXEMPTION**  
**APPLICANT: Hai Xin**  
**LOCATION: 1140 South Spring Meadow Drive**  
**REQUEST: The project consists of an administrative use permit (AUP), subcommittee for design review, second unit review (SUR), and tree removal permit to construct a 9,869 square-foot new two-story house with second-floor balconies/decks, a 798-square foot detached accessory dwelling unit (ADU), an 896-square foot detached 3-car garage, a 2,105-square foot recreational vehicle garage with a workshop, a series of retaining walls (8'-0" maximum height), and wood deck. The project requires approval of an AUP because the proposed two-story house exceeds the maximum unit size by no more than 25%, the project involves retaining walls higher than four feet, the project involves second floor balconies/decks, and accessory structures exceeding 1,000-square feet in size are proposed. A tree removal permit is required for the removal of 2 – 16' palm trees, 1 – 30' palm tree, and 1 – 6' oak tree. A second unit review (SUR) application was submitted for the ADU. Although the ADU is subject to subcommittee design review, the Planning Commission can not take action on the SUR application, since a SUR application is ministerial.**
3. **CODE AMENDMENT NO. 20-07**  
**GENERAL EXEMPTION**  
**LOCATION: City Wide**  
**REQUEST: The proposed code amendment consists of an amendment to Chapter 26 (Zoning) of the West Covina Municipal Code to allow and regulate off-sale (retail sales for off-site consumption) of beer and wine as an accessory use to a service station.**

## **NON-HEARING ITEMS - None**

***TEN-DAY APPEAL PERIOD:*** *Actions taken by the Planning Commission that are not recommendations to the City Council will become final after ten (10) calendar days unless a written appeal with the appropriate fee is lodged with the City Clerk's Office before close of business on the tenth day.*

## **COMMISSION REPORTS/COMMENTS AND MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS**

This is the time when any member of the Commission may bring a matter to the attention of the full Commission that is within the scope of duties assigned to the Commission. Any item that was considered during the Agenda is not appropriate for discussion in this section of the agenda. **NO COMMISSION DISCUSSION OR ACTION CAN BE CONSIDERED AT THIS TIME.** If the Commission desires to discuss an issue raised by a speaker or take an action, the Commission may vote to agendize the matter for a future meeting.

### **4. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR'S REPORT:**

- a. Forthcoming - October 13, 2020
- b. Subcommittee for Design Review Minutes - July 14, 2020 and August 25, 2020

### **5. CITY COUNCIL ACTION:**

This is an oral presentation of City Council matters and actions, which are in the Commission's area of interest

## **ADJOURNMENT**

*City of West Covina*  
**A G E N D A**

**ITEM NO. 1.**

**DATE: September 22, 2020**

**TO:** Planning Commission  
**FROM:** Planning Division  
**SUBJECT:** Regular meeting, August 25, 2020

---

**Attachments**

Minutes 8.25.20

---

**These minutes are preliminary and are considered unofficial  
until adopted at the next Planning Commission meeting.**

**A G E N D A**

**DATE: September 22, 2020**

**ITEM NO.: 1**

**MINUTES  
REGULAR MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION  
CITY OF WEST COVINA  
Tuesday, August 25, 2020**

The regular meeting of the Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. in the West Covina Council Chambers. The Commission observed a moment of silent prayer/meditation and Commissioner Redholtz lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

**ROLL CALL**

Present: Heng, Holtz, Kennedy and Redholtz

Absent: Jaquez (arrived at 7:24 p.m.)

City Staff Present: Persico, Burns

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

1. Regular meeting, July 28, 2020

The minutes were approved as presented.

**OTHER MATTERS OR ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

City Manager David Carmany and Acting Community Development Director Mark Persico spoke regarding a \$500,000 grant awarded to West Covina to rewrite the Zoning Code.

Chairperson Heng also requested that the city provide funds for Planning Commissioners to attend the League of California Cities Planning Commissioner's Academy.

Commissioner Jaquez arrived at 7:24 p.m.

**PUBLIC HEARINGS - None**

**NON-HEARING ITEMS**

2. SMALL COLLECTION RECYCLING FACILITIES ANNUAL REPORT

Planning Manager Jo-Anne Burns presented the staff report. During her presentation she said there was only one recycling center left in the city. She told the Commission that this center was clean and well-maintained. She also said that the annual review of recycling centers had been initiated when there were multiple centers located near residential zones that were not well-maintained.

There was a short discussion regarding compliance with state requirements for recycling centers, recycling included in the trash pick-up by Athens Services and the need for annual review of recycling centers since there is only one facility in West Covina. During the discussion Chairperson Heng expressed her support of continuing the annual review. There was further discussion by the Commission regarding this matter.

Motion by Redholtz, seconded by Holtz, to discontinue the annual review of recycling centers by the Planning Commission. Motion carried 5-0.

3. STUDY SESSION FOR DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR WIRELESS TELECOMMUNICATIONS FACILITIES IN THE PUBLIC RIGHT-OF-WAY

Chairperson Heng told residents this matter would affect every resident in the city. Planning Manager Jo-Anne Burns presented the staff report. During her presentation she reviewed the discussion by the Commission at the July 28, 2020 study session and presented the Support Structure Hierarchy and Location Hierarchy for non-residential zones and residential zones. Staff recommended that the Commission accept the report to support discussion pertaining to the Design Guidelines for Telecommunications Facilities in the Public Right of Way. There was a discussion by the Commission regarding the Hierarchy. The Commission concurred that the hierarchy presented by staff was correct and reflected the matters discussed at the previous study sessions. There was a short discussion regarding these guidelines being presented to the Council for their review. Ms. Burns told the Commission that the guidelines would be incorporated into the new code and would be presented to the City Council, along with the old guidelines.

Motion by Redholtz, seconded by Holtz, to receive and file the report. Motion carried 4-1, (Heng opposed.) Chairperson Heng said she was opposed because she wanted to have more review and discussion about the new guidelines.

COMMISSION REPORTS/COMMENTS AND MISCELLANEOUS ITEMS

Commissioner Redholtz commented that it's nice to be holding meetings in the Council Chamber again and expressed his hope that the Covid-19 situation continues to improve.

Commissioner Jaquez asked about rewriting the Zoning Code.

4. COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR'S REPORT:

a. Forthcoming – September 8, 2020

Acting Community Development Director Mark Persico told the Commission that, due to a lack of business, the regular meeting of September 8, 2020 would be cancelled. The next regular meeting will be held on September 22, 2020.

5. CITY COUNCIL ACTION:

Acting Community Development Director Mark Persico told the Commission that the City Council would consider initiating a code amendment to allow the sale of beer and wine at service stations at the September 1, 2020 meeting. There was a short discussion regarding the proposed code amendment.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairperson Heng adjourned the meeting at 8:05 p.m.

Respectfully submitted:

Lydia de Zara  
Senior Administrative Assistant

**ADOPTED AS SUBMITTED ON:**

**ADOPTED AS AMENDED ON:**



**PLANNING DEPARTMENT STAFF REPORT**

---

**SUBJECT**

**ADMINISTRATIVE USE PERMIT NO. 17-15**

**SUBCOMMITTEE FOR DESIGN REVIEW NO. 17-27**

**TREE REMOVAL PERMIT NO. 20-09**

**CATEGORICAL EXEMPTION**

**APPLICANT: Hai Xin**

**LOCATION: 1140 South Spring Meadow Drive**

**REQUEST:** The project consists of an administrative use permit (AUP), subcommittee for design review, second unit review (SUR), and tree removal permit to construct a 9,869 square-foot new two-story house with second-floor balconies/decks, a 798-square foot detached accessory dwelling unit (ADU), an 896-square foot detached 3-car garage, a 2,105-square foot recreational vehicle garage with a workshop, a series of retaining walls (8'-0" maximum height), and wood deck. The project requires approval of an AUP because the proposed two-story house exceeds the maximum unit size by no more than 25%, the project involves retaining walls higher than four feet, the project involves second floor balconies/decks, and accessory structures exceeding 1,000-square feet in size are proposed. A tree removal permit is required for the removal of 2 – 16' palm trees, 1 – 30' palm tree, and 1 – 6' oak tree. A second unit review (SUR) application was submitted for the ADU. Although the ADU is subject to subcommittee design review, the Planning Commission can not take action on the SUR application, since a SUR application is ministerial.

**BACKGROUND**

The project site is a 65,340-square foot flag lot with approximately 20 feet of street frontage along Spring Meadow Drive. The site is currently developed with an existing single-story residence. The project site is a hillside lot characterized by its up sloping terrain, in which the existing building pad is approximately 80 feet higher than the street. The site is adjacent to single-family residences on the north, south, west, and west.

ITEM	DESCRIPTION
<b>ZONING AND GENERAL PLAN</b>	"Residential Single Family" (R-1) and "Neighborhood - Low Density Residential" (NL)
<b>SURROUNDING LAND USES AND ZONING</b>	North: Residential Single Family (R-1); Residential Home South: Residential Single Family (R-1); Residential Home East: Residential Single Family (R-1); Residential Home West: Residential Single Family (R-1); Residential Home
<b>CURRENT DEVELOPMENT</b>	Single Family Residential Home

<b>LEGAL NOTICE</b>	Legal Notice was published in the San Gabriel Valley Tribune, and was mailed to 25 owners and occupants of the properties located within 300 feet of the subject site.
---------------------	--

### **Code Enforcement Case**

The project site has an outstanding code enforcement case for unpermitted grading. The property owner is working with the City to address the unpermitted grading. Although the proposed retaining walls would allow for the construction of the proposed large house and other accessory structures, the proposed retaining wall would also address slope stability issues.

Additionally, Code Enforcement has investigated reports/complaints that the site is being used as a Buddhist Temple and found that the property is owned by a religious organization. However, the City's Code Enforcement officers did not physically observe large gatherings or any religious services being conducted onsite. In its investigation, Code Enforcement found a website listing the residence as an Airbnb, which is an unpermitted use in the City. This violation is being addressed separately and is unrelated to the review of the application.

### **Letter of Concern**

Prior to the distribution of the Planning Commission packet, staff received a letter of concern from a neighbor (Attachment No. 2). In addition, staff also received phone calls from two other neighbors. The neighbors' concerns are related to the size of the house and potential noise impacts.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **Administrative Use Permit**

The Administrative Use Permit is required because the proposed two-story house is considered a large house in that it exceeds the 8,000 sq. ft. maximum unit size for lots 40,000 sq. ft. or greater, the project involves the construction of retaining walls greater than 4'-0" tall, the proposal involves the construction of second-story decks, and proposed accessory structures exceed 1,000 square feet in size.

### ***Large Two-Story House, Deck, and Retaining Walls***

The project involves the demolition of the existing single-story house and the construction of a 9,869 sq. ft. two-story residence (6,343 sq. ft. first floor and 3,526 sq. ft. second floor). The proposed house will be constructed on an expanded building pad that would be made possible through the construction of a series of four levels of terracing retaining walls. The first level is approximately 6'-0" tall and would be constructed on the "court yard" level, southeast of the proposed recreational vehicle garage. Each terracing retaining wall above this initial wall would be 8'-0" tall (maximum height) with at least 5'-0" of separation in between walls so that it is not counted as one structure per the Code. The house, including its covered patios/porches, would also be at least 5'-0" from any retaining wall so that its height is allowed to be measured as an individual structure. The proposed two-story house complies with all setback requirements and complies with the 25'-0" maximum height allowed (as measured from finished grade).

The first floor of the house will have an entry foyer/lobby, a living room, an office, a lounge room, a dining room, kitchen, laundry room, media room, two storage rooms, three bathrooms, two study rooms, two bedrooms, and a gym. The entry and sides of the house is enhanced by covered patios totaling 1,200

square feet in area.

The second floor will have 6 bedrooms with a bathroom in each bedroom and a family room. A large portion of the second story is not considered as floor area and consist of open volume space area that allows a two-story ceiling for the main living area on the first floor. The second-floor also has an elaborately designed, 1,745-square foot second-floor deck/balcony that spans almost the entire perimeter of the second floor.

Staff has concerns regarding privacy impacts to the northerly neighbor because the north side neighbor is located downslope and views from the proposed residence to the neighbor's pool may be possible. Staff has included a condition of approval in the draft resolution requiring the installation of shrubs and trees along the northside of the building pad to alleviate privacy impacts. The Planning Commission also has the option of requiring the second-floor deck/balcony to be reduced/eliminated on the north side.

### ***Large Accessory Structure and Retaining Wall***

The project involves the construction of two accessory structures: 1) a 2,105 square-foot recreational vehicle garage with an attached workshop and 2) an 896 square foot detached three-car garage. The proposed accessory dwelling unit is not a part of this review and is not within the Planning Commission purview because State law requires ministerial review of accessory dwelling units and its discretionary review is not allowed.

The proposed recreational vehicle garage and workshop would be located in front of the proposed house on the "court yard" area. The court yard area would be created through the installation of fill supported by a 6'-0" tall outward facing retaining wall located mid lot approximately 230 feet from the front property line, spanning approximately 100 feet from north to south.

Although the Code requires approval of an Administrative Use Permit for large accessory structures, the Code does not limit its size. Staff does not have any concerns regarding the size of the proposed accessory structures. However, the following design considerations could be made and are included as conditions of approval in the draft resolution: 1) redesign the roof of the recreational vehicle garage so that it is consistent and matches the roof design of the workshop and proposed house; and 2) remove and/or change the workshop windows to clerestory.

The development will comply with development standards as follows:

	<b>PROPOSED</b>	<b>REQUIRED/STANDARD</b>
<b>HOUSE SIZE</b>	9,869 sq. ft.	8,000 sq. ft. (9,999 sq. ft. with AUP)
<b>LOT COVERAGE</b>	0.15	0.35
<b>FLOOR AREA RATIO</b>	0.15	---
<b>SETBACKS (closest structure)</b>	230 ft.	30 ft
Front	10 ft.	10 ft
North side	10 ft	10 ft
South side	25 ft, 10 in.	25 ft
Rear		
<b>HEIGHT</b>	25 ft	25 ft

### ***Staff Survey of Surrounding Residences***

The following chart shows the mean and median lot size, square footage of the homes, number of bedrooms, and floor area ratio of the surveyed homes. The mean is the average of all 10 homes, and the median is the number that falls directly in the middle of listed in numerical order.

	LOT SIZE	FLOOR AREA	FLOOR AREA RATIO
MEAN	48,253 sq ft	3,564 sq ft	0.09
MEDIAN	53,272 sq ft	3,341 sq ft	0.07
PROPOSED	65,340 sq ft	9,869 sq ft	0.15

The proposed house would be 2.77 times larger than the average size house within the survey area and would be the largest house in the neighborhood. The homes in the survey area range from 2,626 square feet to 5,382 square feet. Although the proposed house is far larger than the other homes in the area, the size of the house is not unusual for estate properties similar to the subject lot. Due to the lot's hillside nature, small street frontage, and the proposed house's distance from the street, the project will have very minimal impacts on the streetscape along Spring Meadow Drive.

### **Subcommittee for Design Review**

The Subcommittee for Design Review met on August 25, 2020 and determined to forward the Subcommittee Design Review application to the Planning Commission to be reviewed concurrently with the Administrative Use Permit. The following is a discussion of Subcommittee Guidelines for new two-story homes:

***1. Design the two-story house or addition so that all setbacks, including second story, have been met. The proposed two-story single-family homes are in compliance with all applicable setback requirements.***

The proposed house complies with all setback requirements. The proposed house and accessory structures are sited greater than 200 feet from the front property line, 10 feet from the side property lines, and 25 feet, 10 inches from the rear property line.

***2. In area that is predominantly one story, it is encouraged that the size of the second story be reduced in relation to the ground floor. A smaller second floor will not appear as massive or boxy. (Plate height shall be consistent with the first story of the house)***

The subject property is located in a neighborhood that has a mixture of single-story and two-story homes. The portion of Spring Meadow Drive that the subject lot is located on is comprised of hillside lots with homes that are minimally visible from the street. The proposed first floor ceiling height is 10.5-feet in height and the proposed second floor ceiling height is 9-feet. The proposed house would have a 6,343 square foot first-floor and a 3,526-square foot second floor. The proposed plate height for the second floor is 18-inches lower than the first floor plate height and the proposed first floor area is larger than the second floor area for the proposed home.

***3. New two-story additions can result in privacy impacts to neighboring properties. Design the second story to reduce or eliminate the need for windows on the side elevations. High windows that allow light in but restrict views onto neighboring properties may also reduce privacy impacts. In an area that is***

***predominately one story, the elements of the house usually emphasize the horizontal. Many modern two-story designs emphasize the vertical through two-story porches with tall columns, tall windows, and two-story front elevations with no horizontal breaks. These elements are generally out-of-character with a one-story neighborhood.***

Staff has concerns regarding privacy impacts to the northerly neighbor because the north side neighbor is located downslope and views from the proposed residence to the neighbor's pool may be possible. Staff has included a condition of approval in the draft resolution requiring the installation of shrubs and trees along the northside of the building pad to alleviate privacy impacts. The Planning Commission also has the option of requiring the second-floor deck/balcony to be reduced/eliminated on the north side. There are no second-floor windows on the north side.

***4. When adding a second-story elevation in a one-story area, it is encouraged to provide a significant second-story setback on the front elevation. By adding back the second story from the first story, the front of the house will fit better in the context of a one-story neighborhood.***

The neighborhood is comprised of a mixture of single-story and two-story homes. The proposed house is greater than 200 feet from the street.

***5. In an area that is predominately one story, the addition of a second-story balcony, especially in a flatland neighborhood, can have an effect on privacy. In these areas, balconies in rear yards are discouraged.***

The subject lot is a hillside lot. Second-floor balconies/decks are proposed along the north, south, east, and west sides of the house. The deck along the west (front) will overlook the subject lot, views from the deck along the south side will be blocked by the proposed ADU structure, and the views from the deck along the east side (rear) will be blocked by the upslope (the neighboring properties to the rear are located on the other side of the slope/ridge).

Staff has concerns regarding privacy impacts to the northerly neighbor because the north side neighbor is located downslope and views from the proposed residence to the neighbor's pool may be possible. Staff has included a condition of approval in the draft resolution requiring the installation of shrubs and trees along the northside of the building pad to alleviate privacy impacts. The Planning Commission also has the option of requiring the second-floor deck/balcony to be reduced/eliminated on the north side. There are no second-floor windows on the north side.

***6. When designing a second-story addition, consider that all sides of the second story are visible. Window treatment on second-story windows is encouraged.***

All proposed windows include wood trim.

***7. Discuss your proposed house or addition with adjacent neighbors. An administrative use permit or conditional use permit requires written notification to all property owners and residents within 300-feet of the property.***

The city sent out a public hearing notice to 25 property owners and occupants within the 300-foot radius.

***8. Landscaping that is removed or destroyed during the construction process shall be replaced prior to final inspection.***

The applicant has applied for Tree Removal Permit to remove four trees. All the trees proposed to be removed are not heritage trees. The applicant is required to submit a landscape plan with proposed tree replacement plantings prior to building permit issuance.

***9. Provide the City-owned parkway width for the strip of property between the private property and the street. (This area is to allow for sidewalks or the widening of the street.)***

The applicant has illustrated the city-owned parkway width on the site plan.

**Tree Removal Permit**

The project will require the removal of four trees, all of which are considered Significant trees by Section 26-294, Division 9 of the WCMC because they are at least 12" in caliper and are located within the front yard of the existing lot, and/or are Oak/Sycamore trees 6" or more in caliper. The significant trees proposed for removal include: 2 – 16" palm trees, 1 – 30" palm tree, and 1 – 6" oak tree. The installation of four 36" box-sized trees would be required as a condition of approval.

**REQUIRED FINDINGS**

Before an application for an administrative use permit may be granted, the following findings must be made:

***a. The lot and proposed development is consistent with the general plan, zoning, and meets all other applicable code requirements.***

The proposed house is consistent with the Neighborhood Low (up to 8 dwelling units per acre) General Plan designation and "Single Family Residential" (R-1) zoning in that it consists of the construction of one single-family residence. The project meets all applicable requirements of the "Single Family Residential" (R-1) zone, Area District III.

***b. The development utilizes building materials, color schemes and a roof style which blend with the existing structure, if any, and results in a development which is harmonious in scale and mass with the surrounding residences.***

The neighborhood consists of one-story and second-story houses in a variety of architectural styles. The proposed house and accessory structures will exhibit a traditional architectural style utilizing stone and wood veneer, wood window trim, and a hipped roof. The proposed house and accessory structures are proportional to the size of the lot. As conditioned, the proposed retaining walls will be screened by landscaping.

***c. The development is sensitive and not detrimental to convenience and safety of circulation for pedestrians and vehicles.***

The proposed house will be accessible from a new driveway on Spring Meadow Drive and will not negatively impact circulation or safety for pedestrians and vehicles. The proposed house does not have negative impacts to convenience and safety of circulation for pedestrians or vehicles in that it will not result in any visual obstructions adjacent to a right-of-the-way.

***d. The development can be adequately served by existing or required infrastructure and services.***

The lot is adequately served by existing infrastructure (streets, sewer, water, etc.). The proposed two-story house and accessory structures are not anticipated to require additional infrastructure or services beyond that provided for the existing residences nearby. Therefore, the development can be adequately served by existing infrastructure and services.

***e. The design of the structure has given consideration to the privacy of surrounding properties through the usage and placement of windows and doors, cantilevers, decks, balconies, minimal retaining walls, trees and other buffering landscaping materials.***

As conditioned, the design of the house will not cause privacy impacts to the surrounding neighbors. Second-floor balconies/decks are proposed along the north, south, east, and west sides of the house. The deck along the west (front) will overlook the subject lot, views from the deck along the south side will be blocked by the proposed ADU structure, and the views from the deck along the east side (rear) will be blocked by the upslope (the neighboring properties to the rear are located on the other side of the slope/ridge).

There are concerns regarding privacy impacts to the northerly neighbor because the north side neighbor is located downslope and views from the proposed residence to the neighbor's pool may be possible. This will be addressed through the required installation of shrubs and trees along the north side of the deck.

***f. The development is sensitive to the natural terrain, minimizes necessary grading, de-emphasizes vertical massing which could disrupt the profile of a natural slope, and does not impede any scenic vistas or views open to the public or surrounding properties.***

The project will not impede scenic vistas or public views. Although the proposed lot is a hillside lot and construction of retaining walls are required to support the installation of fill and to allow for the construction of the house and accessory structures, the lot area that will be disturbed in comparison to the size of the lot is not significant. Any necessary grading for construction will require that a grading permit be obtained from the Engineering Division.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION**

The proposal is considered to be categorically exempt, pursuant to Section 15303 (Class 1, New Construction) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), as the proposal involves the construction of new single-family dwelling unit.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

Planning staff recommends that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving Administrative Use Permit No. 17-15, and approve Subcommittee for Design Review No. 17-27 and Tree Removal Permit No. 20-09.

## **LARGE ATTACHMENTS**

Plans are available for review at West Covina City Hall. Since City Hall is currently closed to the public due to COVID 19, please contact (626) 939-8422 to make arrangements with staff to view the plans.

**Submitted by:** Jo-Anne Burns, Planning Manager

---

### **Attachments**

Attachment No. 1 - Resolution of Approval

Attachment No. 2 - Email from Neighbor dated 9-14-20

---



**PLANNING COMMISSION**

**RESOLUTION NO. 20-**

**A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST COVINA, CALIFORNIA, APPROVING ADMINISTRATIVE USE PERMIT NO. 17-15**

---

**ADMINISTRATIVE USE PERMIT NO. 17-15**

**CATERGORICAL EXEMPTION**

**APPLICANT:** Hai Xin

**LOCATION:** 1140 S Spring Meadow Drive

---

WHEREAS, there was filed with this City a verified application on the forms prescribed in Chapter 26, Article VI of the West Covina Municipal Code, requesting approval of an administrative use permit to allow the construction of a large two-story home with second floor decks/balconies, retaining walls (8'-0" maximum height), and large accessory structures:

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission upon giving the required notice did on the 22<sup>nd</sup> day of September, 2020, conduct a duly advertised public hearing as prescribed by law to consider said application; and

WHEREAS, concurrent with this application, a tree removal permit and subcommittee for design review application has been submitted and reviewed; and

WHEREAS, studies and investigations made by this Commission and in its behalf reveal the following facts:

1. The applicant is requesting the approval of an administrative use permit (AUP) to construct a 9,869 square-foot new two-story house with second-floor balconies/decks, an 896 square foot detached 3-car garage, a 2,105 square foot recreational vehicle garage with a workshop, a series of retaining walls (8'-0" maximum height), and wood deck. The property is located in Area District III.
2. Appropriate findings for approval of an administrative use permit are as follows:
  - a. The lot and proposed development is consistent with the general plan, zoning, and meets all other applicable code requirements.

- b. The development utilizes building materials, color schemes, and a roof style which blend with the existing structure, if any, and results in a development which harmonious in scale and mass with surrounding residences.
  - c. The development is sensitive and not detrimental to convenience and safety of circulation for pedestrians and vehicles.
  - d. The development can be adequately served by existing or required infrastructure and services.
  - e. The design of the structure has given consideration to the privacy of surrounding properties through the usage and placement of windows and doors, cantilevers, decks, balconies, minimal retaining walls, trees, and other buffering landscaping materials.
  - f. The development is sensitive to the natural terrain, minimizes necessary grading, de-emphasizes vertical massing which could disrupt the profile of a natural slope, and does not impede any scenic vistas or views open to the public or surrounding properties.
3. The proposal is considered to be categorically exempt, pursuant to Section 15303 (Class 1, New Construction) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), as the proposal involves the construction of a two-story single-family residence, accessory structures, and retaining walls.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Planning Commission of the City of West Covina does resolve as follows:

1. On the basis of the evidence presented, both oral and documentary, for Administrative Use Permit No. 17-15, the Planning Commission makes the following findings:
- a. The proposed house is consistent with the Neighborhood Low (up to 8 dwelling units per acre) General Plan designation and "Single Family Residential" (R-1) zoning in that it consists of the construction of one single-family residence. The project meets all applicable requirements of the "Single Family Residential" (R-1) zone, Area District III.
  - b. The neighborhood consists of one-story and second-story houses in a variety of architectural styles. The proposed house and accessory structures will exhibit a traditional architectural style utilizing stone and wood veneer, wood window trim, and a hipped roof. The proposed house and accessory structures are proportional to the size of the lot. As conditioned, the proposed retaining walls will be screened by landscaping.

- c. The proposed house will be accessible from a new driveway on Spring Meadow Drive and will not negatively impact circulation or safety for pedestrians and vehicles. The proposed house does not have negative impacts to convenience and safety of circulation for pedestrians or vehicles in that it will not result in any visual obstructions adjacent to a right-of-the-way.
- d. The lot is adequately served by existing infrastructure (streets, sewer, water, etc.). The proposed two-story house and accessory structures are not anticipated to require additional infrastructure or services beyond that provided for the existing residences nearby. Therefore, the development can be adequately served by existing infrastructure and services.
- e. As conditioned, the design of the house will not cause privacy impacts to the surrounding neighbors. Second-floor balconies/decks are proposed along the north, south, east, and west sides of the house. The deck along the west (front) will overlook the subject lot, views from the deck along the south side will be blocked by the proposed ADU structure, and the views from the deck along the east side (rear) will be blocked by the upslope (the neighboring properties to the rear are located on the other side of the slope/ridge).

There are concerns regarding privacy impacts to the northerly neighbor because the north side neighbor is located downslope and views from the proposed residence to the neighbor's pool may be possible. This will be addressed through the required installation of shrubs and trees along the north side of the deck.

- f. The project will not impede scenic vistas or public views. Although the proposed lot is a hillside lot and construction of retaining walls are required to support the installation of fill and to allow for the construction of the house and accessory structures, the lot area that will be disturbed in comparison to the size of the lot is not significant. Any necessary grading for construction will require that a grading permit be obtained from the Engineering Division.
2. That pursuant to all of the evidence presented, both oral and documentary, and further based on the findings above, the Administrative Use Permit is approved subject to the provisions of the West Covina Municipal Code, provided that the physical development of the herein described property shall conform to said plan and the conditions set forth herein which, except as otherwise expressly indicated, shall be fully performed and completed or shall be secured by bank or cash deposit satisfactory to the Community Development Director, before the use or occupancy of the property is commenced and before the Certificate of Occupancy is issued, and the violation of any of which shall be grounds for revocation of said precise plan by the Planning Commission or City Council.

3. That the administrative use permit shall not be effective for any purpose until the owner of the property involved (or a duly authorized representative) has filed at the office of the Community Development Director, his affidavit stating he is aware of, and accepts, all conditions of this precise plan and tree removal permit as set forth below. Additionally, no permits shall be issued until the owner of the property involved (or a duly authorized representative) pays all costs associated with the processing of this application pursuant to City Council Resolution No. 8690.
4. The costs and expenses of any enforcement activities, including, but not limited to attorneys' fees, caused by the applicant's violation of any condition imposed by this approval or any provision of the West Covina Municipal Code shall be paid by the applicant.
5. That pursuant to all of the evidence presented, both oral and documentary, and further based on the findings above, Administrative Use Permit No. 17-15 is approved, subject to the following conditions:
  - a. Comply with administrative use permit reviewed by the Planning Commission on September 22, 2020.
  - b. Comply with the development standards of "Single-Family Residential" (R-1) Zone, Area District III and all applicable provisions of the West Covina Municipal Code.
  - c. This approval allows for the construction of a new 9,869 square-foot new two-story house with second-floor balconies/decks, an 896 square foot detached 3-car garage, a 2,105 square foot recreational vehicle garage with a workshop, a series of retaining walls (8'-0" maximum height), and wood deck.
  - d. The retaining wall shall be constructed out of decorative material, such as stone, masonry, wood, textured poured concrete, and textured colored precision block with colored grout.
  - e. The retaining wall must be constructed in a color that matches the house. The color must be indicated on the final plans.
  - f. That prior to final building permit approval, a detailed landscape and irrigation plan in compliance with AB 1881 and Executive Order B-29-15 shall be submitted for the property. Plans shall include type, size and quantity of landscape materials and irrigation equipment. All vegetation areas shall be automatically irrigated and a detailed watering program and water budget shall be provided. All damaged vegetation shall be replaced and the site shall be kept free of diseased or dead plant materials and litter at all times. The applicant shall coordinate with the applicable water district to determine if the water district has any specific requirements for water efficient landscaping. All approved landscaping shall be installed per the approved plans prior to building permit final.

- g. The landscape plans shall also include the installation of four 36" box-sized trees on site, the installation of a combination of trees and shrubs along the north side of the deck to screen views and alleviate privacy impacts to the north side neighbor, the installation of landscaping in front of all retaining walls to provide a view buffer.
- h. The workshop windows shall be removed or replaced with clerestory windows. The elevations and floor plan shall be revised to reflect the change prior to building permit issuance.
- i. The recreational vehicle garage roof shall be revised to be consistent with the roof design of the workshop and proposed house. The roof plan and elevations shall be revised to reflect this change prior to building permit issuance.
- j. Prior to building permit issuance, an arborist report prepared by a ISA certified arborist shall be prepared assessing the health of all existing trees on site and provide recommendations on protecting the health of the trees (to be retained) during construction. The applicant shall comply with all the arborist's recommendations throughout the construction.
- k. A minimum 10-foot substantially flat area for pedestrian and emergency access shall be provided between the rear of the house and the slope, measured perpendicularly from the structure (a one-story open patio cover may be located in the level area). The site plan shall clearly indicate this area prior to building permit issuance.
- l. Final plans shall include the location of the water heater and all mechanical equipment. Water heater enclosures, if proposed, must be consistent with the house in materials and colors. Mechanical equipment is not permitted on the roof.
- m. Air conditioning and heating ducting shall not be exposed on roofs per WCMC Sec. 26-409. Roof-mounted mechanical equipment is not permitted.
- n. That any proposed change to the approved administrative use permit shall be reviewed by the Planning, Building, Engineering, Fire and Police Departments, and the written authorization of the Community Development Director shall be obtained prior to implementation.
- o. Prior to requesting a final inspection by the Building Division, the Planning Division shall inspect the house.
- p. The applicant shall sign an affidavit accepting all conditions of this approval.

- q. All outstanding fees and any required development impact fees shall be paid prior to the issuance of a building permit.
- r. Building Division Requirements:
  - 1. All Conditions of Approval as approved by the Planning Commission shall appear as notes on the plans submitted for building plan check and permits.
  - 2. Building design shall comply with the design shall comply with the 2019 California Building Code (CBC).
  - 3. Separate application(s), plan check(s), and permit(s) is/are required for:
    - a. Grading (see Engineering Division for requirements)
    - b. Demolition work
    - c. Retaining walls (see Engineering Division for requirements)
    - d. Block walls exceeding 6 feet in height
    - e. Fire sprinkler/Alarm systems (see Fire Department Prevention Bureau for requirements)
    - f. Plumbing
    - g. Mechanical
    - h. Electrical
    - i. Each separate structure/building
  - 4. Complete structural plans with calculations by State licensed engineer or architect will be required. Submit design for review at formal plans review.
  - 5. Compliance to California T-24 Energy regulations will be required. Submit design for review at formal plans review.
  - 6. Compliance to California Green Building Standards Code will be required. Submit design for review at formal plans review.
  - 7. Separate plumbing, mechanical and electrical plan check will be required. Submit design for review at formal plans review.
  - 8. A soils and geology report will be required to address the potential for and the mitigation measures of any seismic induced landslide/liquefaction. Soils report shall address foundation design and site preparation requirements.
  - 9. All on-site utility service lines shall be placed underground. WCMC 23-273.
  - 10. Fire sprinkler system required per California Residential Code. WCMC § 7-16.

s. Engineering Division Requirements:

1. Comply with all conditions contained in Planning Commission Resolution No. 567. Which outlined the requirements of grading, street improvement, exterior lighting, water supply, all bonds, trees, landscaping, drainage, and building related improvements, etc.
2. Sanitary sewers shall be provided to each "lot" in compliance with Municipal Code Chapter 23, Article 2, and to the satisfaction of the City Engineer.
3. Adequate provision shall be made for acceptance and disposal of surface drainage entering the property from adjacent areas.
4. All damaged concrete curbs, gutters, sidewalk, etc., shall be removed and reconstruct per City standard.
5. Prior to issuance of Building Permit, all of the following requirements shall be satisfied:
  - a) A final grading and drainage plan showing existing and proposed elevations and drainage structures (and showing existing and proposed on-site and off-site improvements) shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Department and Engineering Division.
  - b) An itemized cost estimate for all on-site and off-site improvements to be constructed (except buildings) shall be submitted to the Engineering Division for approval. Based upon the approved cost estimates, required fees shall be paid and improvement securities for all on-site and off-site improvements (except buildings) and 100% labor/material securities for all off-site improvements shall be posted prior to final approval of the plans.
  - c) A soil erosion and sediment control plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Planning Department and Engineering Division
6. Comply with all regulations of the Los Angeles Regional Water Quality Control Board and Article II of Chapter 9 of the West Covina Municipal Code concerning Stormwater/Urban Run-off Pollution control.
7. Provide hydrology study
8. Provide soils report with soils percolation and infiltration rates

t. FIRE DEPARTMENT:

1. NFPA 13D/13R/13 Fire Sprinkler System.
2. One-hour rated wall assembly & door required between house & new attached garage
3. New Fire Flow Test Required.
4. Required Fire Flow of 1,500-GPM @ 20 psi for 2 hours
5. Ensure 1 fire hydrant within 250 feet of property line
6. Provide a 20-foot minimum wide fire lane with approved turnaround
7. Hard-wired smoke and carbon monoxide detectors required.
8. One-hour rated door and construction between attached garage and home
9. Additional Fire Department requirements may be set upon future review of a full set of architectural plans.

I HEREBY CERTIFY, that the foregoing Resolution was adopted by the Planning Commission of the City of West Covina, at a regular meeting held on the 22<sup>nd</sup> day of September 2020, by the following

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

DATE: September 22, 2020

EXPIRATION DATE:

September 22, 2022

---



Shenna Heng, Chairperson  
Planning Commission

---

Mark Persico, Secretary  
Planning Commission

**From:** [Vivian Mastrangelo](#)  
**To:** [Jo-Anne Burns](#)  
**Subject:** RE: Planning commission meeting September 22 ,2020 - AUP no.17-15, Subcommittee design review no 17-27, second unit review no.20-35, tree permit 20-09  
**Date:** Monday, September 14, 2020 4:34:49 PM

---

CAUTION: This email originated from outside your organization. Exercise caution when opening attachments or clicking links, especially from unknown senders.

Jo-Anne,

**Regarding property development on 1140 South Spring Meadow road.**

First a special thanks to you for taking the time to explain the process around the Planning Commission Review Process.

I was very concerned to receive this notice related to what appears to be extreme overdevelopment of this residential property.

The sheer size and scope of this development which encompasses a 9869 square foot house which is above the 25% limit as well as a detached 798 foot separate dwelling unit , 798 separate dwelling unit, 896 unit three car garage and a 2105 square foot recreational vehicle garage and workshop which represents almost 14,000 square feet of buildings on the property in addition 8 foot retaining walls . **I also note that in addition to all this the dimensions of the second story balconies were not included .**

Pardon my skepticism but my first question is this truly being built just as a multifamily residence ?

Questions To the planning commission members

As to design, does this home which is being built on a property that formerly housed a 2,000 square foot home fit the community in its size and scope. This house is 5 times bigger than the original dwelling. A somewhat bigger dwelling , more garage space and even a workshop makes some sense but this appears to be an overdevelopment of the land on so many levels . My greatest concern is the nature of the supposed 2,100 square foot recreation vehicle garage with workshop and the anticipated noise levels this will create on a regular basis .

Are the space usage and building specifications being considered laid out in a way that all will be to be structurally sound and that will not negatively impact the surrounding ground area support leading to the canyon below. Our houses were built with swales to protect the land.

This is a quiet residential zoned area and the sheer size of these multiple structures once completed if not adjusted and depending on usage will definitely have significant negative impact on noise levels into the canyon below.

It is my hope that the commission will indeed take a very close look at the environmental impact to the land below with so many structures on the site their proposed usage as well as noise pollution

that will result and negatively impact the current residents of this community.

Thank you for listening.

Sincerely,

Vivian

**Vivian Mastrangelo**

**965 las rosas drive west covina 91791**

**PLANNING DEPARTMENT STAFF REPORT**

---

**SUBJECT**

**CODE AMENDMENT NO. 20-07**

**GENERAL EXEMPTION**

**LOCATION: City Wide**

**REQUEST: The proposed code amendment consists of an amendment to Chapter 26 (Zoning) of the West Covina Municipal Code to allow and regulate off-sale (retail sales for off-site consumption) of beer and wine as an accessory use to a service station.**

**BACKGROUND**

Code Amendment No. 20-07 was initiated by the City Council on September 1, 2020.

Currently, the Municipal Code prohibits the sale of alcoholic beverages at service stations. The proposed code amendment would amend the Municipal Code to allow the off-sale of alcohol at service stations subject to a conditional use permit. The Planning Commission has considered this issue several times over the last few years. In 2008, Code Amendment No. 08-02 was initiated by the City Council to consider amending the code to allow alcohol sales at service stations. That consideration was subsequently abandoned. In 2010, the Planning Commission initiated Code Amendment No. 10-03 to consider the concept. The Code Amendment was later rescinded by the Commission. Most recently in 2018, Code Amendment No. 18-04 was initiated by the Planning Commission and was recommended for City Council approval. Code Amendment No. 18-04 was eventually presented to the City Council in October 2019 but was not adopted by the City Council.

Given that it has been less than one year since the subject has been discussed, staff has noticed Code Amendment No. 20-07 as a public hearing and will present the same language that the Planning Commission recommended for City Council approval in October 2019. Noticing for the proposed code amendment public hearing was published in the San Gabriel Valley Tribune on September 10, 2020.

For reference staff, has included a list that identifies all gasoline stations with convenience stores within the City (Attachment No. 2) and a list of businesses within the City with Type 20/21 alcohol licenses issued by the Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control (Attachment No. 3) with this staff report. Currently, there are 21 gasoline stations with convenience stores within the City. There are a total of 45 stores within the City that have active off-sale alcohol licenses ( 26 liquor stores/convenience stores/mini-marts and 19 supermarkets/pharmacies/department stores).

**DISCUSSION**

The draft code amendment provides the following changes to the West Covina Municipal Code (WCMC):

- Adds a category for off-sale alcohol sales to the Land Use Matrix (WCMC Section 26-597) and identifies that a conditional use permit (CUP) is required for the use in the N-C, R-C, S-C, C-2, C-3, and M-1 zones, and is not allowed in other zoning designations.
- Removes "sale of alcoholic beverages" as prohibited in service stations (WCMC Section 26-664).

- Adds CUP requirement in Alcoholic Beverage Service portion of Municipal Code (WCMC Section 26-685.103) and cross-reference Section 26-685.103.3.
- Adds new section to the Municipal Code (WCMC Section 26-685.103.3) that identifies the CUP process for service stations selling alcohol and lists the following standards:

1. Beer and wine sales shall only be allowed in convenience stores greater than 2,000 square feet in floor area.
2. A maximum of ten (10) percent of the retail floor area shall be allowed for the display and sale of alcohol. Merchandise stacking shall not be included in the retail floor area calculation when determining the maximum area for display and alcohol sales.
3. The sale of beer in quantities fewer than three containers is prohibited and no alcoholic beverage shall be sold in unit quantities less than the distributor's intended resale units.
4. No beer and wine shall be displayed within five feet of the cash register or front door.
5. The advertisement for beer and wine shall not be permitted at motor fuel islands.
6. Identification card reader is required to determine the authenticity of the identification that displays the age of the individual.
7. No pay phone shall be permitted on the exterior of the premises.
8. No beer and wine shall be sold from or displayed in an ice tub.
9. No coin operated video games or video entertainment machines shall be permitted on the premises.
10. Signage shall be posted in the parking lot and on the exterior of the building notifying persons that alcohol shall not be consumed on the premises.
11. Signs shall be prominently posted, stating that California State Law prohibits the sale of beer and wine to persons under the age of 21 years.

During City Council initiation of Code Amendment No. 20-07, Councilmember Castellanos stated that his preference is to eliminate the 2,000 square-foot floor area convenience store size threshold in order to allow a more open competition amongst service station owners. The Planning Commission may choose to make no changes to, to eliminate, revise, or add on to the draft Code.

## **GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY**

The proposed code amendment is consistent with Policy 2.1 (Maintain and enhance the City's current tax base) and Action 2.1a (Continue to strengthen the City's retail base) of the General Plan. The code amendment would allow service station convenience stores to better compete with similar sized markets, which may improve their generation of taxable sales for the City.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION**

The proposal is not subject to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per Section 15061(b)(3) of the CEQA Guidelines, which provides that CEQA only applies to activity that results in direct or reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment and for activity considered to be a project, respectively. The amendment to the West Covina Municipal Code would not result in a physical change in the environment because it would only revise development standards for alcohol sales within service stations.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution recommending approval of Code Amendment No. 20-07 to the City Council.

**Submitted by:** Jo-Anne Burns, Planning Manager

---

### **Attachments**

Attachment No. 1 - Resolution Recommending Approval

Attachment No. 2 -Gasoline Stations with Convenience Stores

Attachment No. 3 - List of Businesses with Type 20/21 ABC Licenses

---

**PLANNING COMMISSION  
RESOLUTION NO.**

**A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF  
WEST COVINA, CALIFORNIA, RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY  
COUNCIL APPROVAL OF CODE AMENDMENT NO. 20-07, CODE  
AMENDMENT RELATED TO ALCOHOL SALES AT SERVICE  
STATIONS**

---

**CODE AMENDMENT NO. 20-07**

**GENERAL EXEMPTION**

**APPLICANT:** City of West Covina

**LOCATION:** Citywide

---

**WHEREAS**, on the 1<sup>st</sup> day of September 2020, the City Council initiated a code amendment to Chapter 26 (Zoning) of the West Covina Municipal Code related to the sale of alcoholic beverages at service stations; and

**WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission, upon giving the required notice, did on the 22<sup>th</sup> day of September 2020, conduct a duly advertised public hearing as prescribed by law; and

**WHEREAS**, studies and investigations made by this Commission and on its behalf reveal the following facts:

1. The City's provisions regarding alcohol uses were last updated in 2017.
2. The Municipal Code currently does not allow sales of alcohol at service stations.
3. It is necessary to revise the standards in order to allow service station convenience stores to fairly compete with other small market and convenience stores which are allowed to sell alcohol for off-site consumption.
4. The proposed action is exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), pursuant to Section 15061(b)(3) of the CEQA Guidelines, in that the proposed action consists of a code amendment, which does not have the potential for causing a significant effect on the environment.

**NOW, THEREFORE, THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF WEST COVINA, CALIFORNIA DOES HEREBY RESOLVE AS FOLLOWS:**

**SECTION NO. 1:** The above recitals are true and correct and are incorporated herein as if set forth herein in full.

**SECTION NO. 2:** Based on the evidence presented and the findings set forth, Code Amendment No. 20-07 is hereby found to be consistent with the West Covina General Plan and the implementation thereof, and that the public necessity, convenience, general welfare, and good zoning practices require Code Amendment No. 20-07.

**SECTION NO. 3:** Based on the evidence presented and the findings set forth, the Planning Commission of the City of West Covina hereby recommends to the City Council of the City of West Covina that it approves Code Amendment No. 20-07 to amend Chapter 26 (Zoning) of the West Covina Municipal Code as shown on Exhibit "A."

**SECTION NO. 4:** The Secretary is instructed to forward a copy of this Resolution to the City Council for their attention in the manner as prescribed by law and this Resolution shall go into force and effect upon its adoption.

I HEREBY CERTIFY, that the foregoing Resolution was adopted by the Planning Commission of the City of West Covina, at a regular meeting held on the 22<sup>th</sup> day of September 2020, by the following vote.

AYES:

NOES:

ABSTAIN:

ABSENT:

DATE:

---

Sheena Heng, Chairperson  
Planning Commission

---

Mark Persico, Secretary  
Planning Commission



**EXHIBIT A**

**ORDINANCE NO. \_\_\_\_**

**AN ORDINANCE OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF WEST COVINA, CALIFORNIA TO AMEND SECTIONS 26-597, 26-664, AND 26-685.103, AND ADDING SECTION 26-685.193.3 TO THE WEST COVINA MUNICIPAL CODE RELATING TO ALCOHOL SALES AT SERVICE STATIONS**

**WHEREAS**, the City's provisions regarding alcohol uses were last updated in 2017; and

**WHEREAS**, the City currently does not allow alcohol sales at service stations; and

**WHEREAS**, on the September 1, 2020, the City Council initiated a code amendment to Chapter 26 (Zoning) of the West Covina Municipal Code related to the sale of alcoholic beverages at service stations; and

**WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission, upon giving the required notice, did on September 22, 2020, conduct a duly advertised public hearing as prescribed by law to make recommendations to the City Council to approve Code Amendment No. 20-07; and

**WHEREAS**, the City Council, upon giving the required notice, did on the \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_ 2020, conduct a duly advertised public hearing as prescribed by law on the proposed ordinance; and

**WHEREAS**, based on review of the State CEQA Guidelines, the City Council finds and determines that the proposed ordinance is statutorily exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) under Section 15061(b)(3) of the CEQA Guidelines, which provides that CEQA only applies to projects that have the potential for causing a significant effect on the environment; and

**WHEREAS**, the City Council has duly considered all information presented to it, including written staff reports and any testimony provided at the public hearing, with all testimony received being made a part of the public record.

**NOW, THEREFORE, THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF WEST COVINA, CALIFORNIA DOES HEREBY ORDAIN AS FOLLOWS:**

**SECTION NO. 1:** Section 26-597 of the West Covina Municipal Code is hereby amended to include the following use within the table, to be inserted consistent with alphabetical ordering:

			M	M	M	M											
	R	R	F	F	F	F	O	N	R	S	C	C	M	I		P	O
	A	1	8	15	20	45	P	C	C	C	2	3	1	P		B	S
<u>Alcohol off-sale, service stations (see art XII, div. 15)</u>								<u>c</u>	<u>c</u>	<u>c</u>	<u>c</u>	<u>c</u>	<u>c</u>				

**SECTION NO. 2:** Section 26-664 of the West Covina Municipal Code is hereby amended to read as follows:

- (a) A service station shall not be established or maintained without facilities to pump gasoline.
- (b) Garage, mechanical repair service not specifically mentioned in Section 26-663, including but not limited to the following items are prohibited:
  - (1) Battery repair.
  - (2) Tire rebuilding or recapping.
  - (3) Painting.
  - (4) Body work.
  - (5) Steam cleaning or radiator repair.
  - (6) Transmission rebuilding.
  - (7) Motor repairs involving the removal of the head or crank case.
- ~~(c) Sale of alcoholic beverages.~~
- ~~(d)~~ (c) Subleasing of floor space or site area except for any use specifically authorized by section 26-663, subparagraphs (a) through (i), (k) and (m).

**SECTION NO. 3:** Section 26-685.103 of the West Covina Municipal Code is hereby amended to read as follows:

An administrative use permit is required in specified commercial and manufacturing zones for any business that sells alcohol for off-site consumption, except for service stations that sell alcohol which requires a conditional use permit pursuant to Section 26-685.103.3.

**SECTION NO. 4:** Section 26-685.103.3 is hereby added to Chapter 26 of the West Covina Municipal Code to read as follows:

Sec. 26-685.103.3 Service Stations Selling Beer and Wine for Off-Premises Consumption

(a) Conditional Use Permit Required. Any service station located in specified commercial and manufacturing zones may sell beer and wine for off-site consumption with a conditional use permit. The sales of distilled spirits shall not be allowed.

(1) The site shall comply with all current development standards for service stations as set forth in the West Covina Municipal Code including, but not limited to, the minimum number of parking spaces prior to the approval of a conditional use permit to allow off-sale of alcohol.

(b) Unless otherwise noted, the following requirements shall apply to all gasoline service stations selling beer and wine:

(1) Beer and wine sales shall only be allowed in convenience stores greater than 2,000 square feet in floor area.

(2) A maximum of ten (10) percent of the retail floor area shall be allowed for the display and sale of alcohol. Merchandize stacking shall not be included in the retail floor area calculation when determining the maximum area for display and alcohol sales.

(3) The sale of beer in quantities fewer than three containers is prohibited and no alcoholic beverage shall be sold in unit quantities less than the distributor's intended resale units.

(4) No beer and wine shall be displayed within five feet of the cash register or front door.

(5) The advertisement of beer and wine shall not be permitted at motor fuel islands.

(6) Identification card reader is required to determine to the authenticity of the identification that displays the age of the individual.

(7) No pay phone shall be permitted on the exterior of the premises.

(8) No beer and wine shall be sold from or displayed in an ice tub.

(9) No coin operated video games or video entertainment machines shall be permitted on the premises.

(10) Signage shall be posted in the parking lot and on the exterior of the building notifying persons that alcohol shall not be consumed on the premises.

(11) Signs shall be prominently posted, stating that California State Law prohibits the sale of beer and wine to persons under the age of 21 years.

**SECTION NO. 5:** That the City Clerk shall certify to the passage of this ordinance and shall cause the same to be published as required by law.

**SECTION NO. 6:** This ordinance shall take effect and be in force thirty (30) days from and after the date of its passage.

**APPROVED AND ADOPTED on this \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_ 2020.**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Tony Wu  
Mayor

**APPROVED AS TO FORM**

**ATTEST**

\_\_\_\_\_  
Thomas P. Duarte

\_\_\_\_\_  
Lisa Sherrick  
Assistant City Clerk

## ATTACHMENT NO. 1

I, LISA SHERRICK, ASSISTANT CITY CLERK of the City of West Covina, California, do hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution No. \_\_\_\_ was duly adopted by the City Council of the City of West Covina, California, at a regular meeting thereof held on the \_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2020, by the following vote of the City Council:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

---

Lisa Sherrick  
Assistant City Clerk

## Gasoline Stations with Convenience Stores with Active Business Licenses within West Covina

Business Name	Business Address	City, State, Zip	Phone Number	Rate Type (STD)	Business Type	NAICS Description	Business Status	License Status
76 CIRCLE K	1200 S GLENDORA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-4924	(626) 850-5300	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Pending - Taxpayer
A R C O AM PM 83044	1333 W MERCED AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790	(626) 962-6129	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
ALL SMOG & TUNE ARCO GAS STATION	645 N SUNSET AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-1661	(626) 337-7422	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
ARCO #42303	201 N GRAND AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1726	(626) 966-7711	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
AZUSA ARCO	300 N AZUSA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1345	(909) 877-4477	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
BADILLO ARCO	901 N SUNSET AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790	(909) 877-4477	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
CIRCLE K #2709500	201 S AZUSA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1904	(951) 270-5168	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
EASTLAND CHEVRON	246 N CITRUS ST	WEST COVINA, CA 91791	(626) 339-3929	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
FAMILY OIL COMPANY	2010 W PACIFIC AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790	(626) 961-0061	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
G & M OIL #117	801 S GLENDORA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790	(626) 851-8796	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
GOLDEN MOTEUR INC	1200 S GLENDORA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-4924	(626) 850-5300	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
M & J SHELL	700 S SUNSET AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3544	(626) 337-1003	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
MY GOODS MARKET #5647	105 S VINCENT AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-2901	(616) 338-4643	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
SOUTH HILLS 76	150 S CITRUS ST	WEST COVINA, CA 91791-2142	(626) 339-8018	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
SUNSET SERVICE CENTER, INC	901 N SUNSET AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790	(626) 960-9229	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
TRIPLE S CHEVRON SERVICE	1209 S SUNSET AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3960	(626) 338-6527	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
UNITED MORGAN ASSOCIATES LLC	901 N SUNSET AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-1244	(909) 877-4477	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Pending - Taxpayer
UNITED OIL #189	123 N GRAND AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1710	(310) 323-3992	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
UNITED OIL #190	2450 S AZUSA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1512	(310) 323-3992	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
VINCENT CHEVRON	206 N VINCENT AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91790-2206	(626) 331-3312	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current
WEST COVINA SHELL AUTO CARE	200 S AZUSA AVE	WEST COVINA, CA 91791	(626) 915-6431	Retail Businesses	GAS STATION	Gasoline Stations With Convenience Stores	Active	Current

## List of Businesses in the City with Active Type 20/21 Licenses from the Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control

	Status	License Type	Primary Owner	Premises Addr.	Business Name
1	ACTIVE	21	VONS COMPANIES INC THE	777 S GLENDORA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790	VONS 2123
2	ACTIVE	21	THRIFTY PAYLESS, INC.	1528 E AMAR RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792	RITE AID STORE 5610
3	ACTIVE	21	STATER BROS MARKETS	1025 E AMAR RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792	STATER BROS MARKETS 54
4	ACTIVE	21	STATER BROS MARKETS	375 N AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791	STATER BROS MARKETS 106
5	ACTIVE	21	FOOD 4 LESS OF CALIFORNIA INC	615 N AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791	FOOD 4 LESS 337
6	ACTIVE	21	KASSAB, ZIAD	2017 W PACIFIC AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790	PACIFIC LIQUOR
7	ACTIVE	21	A & B AZUSA INC	1525 E AMAR RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1619	SEAFOOD CITY SUPERMARKET
8	ACTIVE	20	7 ELEVEN INC	2887 E VALLEY BLVD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792	7 ELEVEN STORE 2175 14003C
9	ACTIVE	21	AZUSA SUPERMARKET INC	1512 E AMAR RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1618	ISLAND PACIFIC SUPERMARKET
10	ACTIVE	20	TARGET CORPORATION	2831 E EASTLAND CTR DR, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1624	TARGET T1028
11	ACTIVE	21	SAFAR, ZOUHAIR GEORGE	1915 W SAN BERNARDINO RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91790	KEG LIQUOR
12	ACTIVE	21	KAUR, SATINDER	1413 W PUENTE AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790	BIG BOB'S LIQUOR & MARKET
13	ACTIVE	21	NORTHGATE GONZALEZ LLC	1320 W FRANCISQUITO AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-4630	NORTHGATE MARKET 22
14	ACTIVE	21	TARGET CORPORATION	2370 S AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1511	TARGET T2147
15	ACTIVE	21	GARFIELD BEACH CVS LLC	727 S GLENDORA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3707	CVS PHARMACY STORE 9735
16	ACTIVE	21	HK2 OF WEST COVINA LLC	987 S GLENDORA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-4205	
17	ACTIVE	21	GARFIELD BEACH CVS LLC	3670 S NOGALES ST, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-2714	CVS PHARMACY 9748
18	ACTIVE	21	GARFIELD BEACH CVS LLC	702 N AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1010	CVS PHARMACY 9687
19	ACTIVE	20	WALGREEN CO	2453 S AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1536	WALGREENS 09560
20	ACTIVE	20	7 ELEVEN INC	235 N AZUSA AVE, STE D & E, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1356	7 ELEVEN
21	ACTIVE	21	MARUKAI CORPORATION	1420 S AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791	TOKYO CENTRAL
22	ACTIVE	20	HEREDIA, JUAN	322 S GLENDORA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3043	EL PILON MEAT MARKET & RESTAURANT
23	ACTIVE	21	PATEL, INDIRA RAMESH	2125 W FRANCISQUITO AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3205	FRANCISQUITO DRIVE IN DAIRY
24	ACTIVE	21	WALMART INC.	2753 E EASTLAND CENTER DR, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-6612	WALMART 5954
25	ACTIVE	20	PATEL, DHARINI RAJESH	1818 E ROWLAND AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1136	ROYAL CREST DAIRY
26	ACTIVE	20	7 ELEVEN INC	1319 W MERCED AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3904	7 ELEVEN STORE 14004B
27	ACTIVE	21	BEVERAGES & MORE INC	2970 E WORKMAN AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1610	BEVMO!
28	ACTIVE	21	LA AMAPOLA INC	130 PLAZA DR, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-2870	LA AMAPOLA
29	ACTIVE	21	AWAN, NUSRAT SHAHEEN	522 E VINE AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-5101	RANCH TOWN MARKET
30	ACTIVE	21	WEST COVINA LIQUOR	1341 S AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-3902	WEST COVINA LIQUOR
31	ACTIVE	20	TOUHEY, DEBBIE JOYCE	551 E VINE AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-5102	ROCKVIEW DAIRY #29
32	ACTIVE	21	S&T ENTERPRISE INC.	100 N GRAND AVE, BLDG A, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1746	7 ELEVEN STORE 39860A
33	ACTIVE	20	99 CENTS ONLY STORES LLC	1516 E AMAR RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1618	99 CENTS ONLY STORE #428
34	ACTIVE	21	TR & V CORP	1005 E AMAR RD, WEST COVINA, CA 91792-1300	CHANTRY'S PANTRY LIQUOR
35	ACTIVE	21	CHONOS, DIANE DENISE	2612 E GARVEY AVE S, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-2113	JUG N JIGGER
36	ACTIVE	20	7 ELEVEN INC	1347 S AZUSA AVE, STE A, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-3965	7 ELEVEN STORE 29939D
37	ACTIVE	21	GOODLIFE SOLUTIONS, LLC	1925 W BADILLO ST, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-1133	BOLAVARD
38	ACTIVE	21	JABBAR, WASILEH GHANEM	430 N AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1347	QUICK STOP LIQUOR & MARKET
39	ACTIVE	21	YOUNAN, WAFA	130 N VINCENT AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-2205	FREEWAY LIQUOR
40	ACTIVE	21	ABOU EID, MATANOS HADI	1230 W FRANCISQUITO AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-4722	LOUIES LIQUOR II
41	ACTIVE	20	SF MARKETS LLC	2630 E WORKMAN AVE, UNIT 315A, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1627	SPROUTS FARMERS MARKET #438
42	ACTIVE	21	INDER BRAR, INC.	334 N AZUSA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1345	LEPRECHAUN LIQUOR & MARKET
43	ACTIVE	21	KING SPIRITS, INC.	944 W WEST COVINA PKWY, WEST COVINA, CA 91790	JERRYS HOUSE OF SPIRITS
44	ACTIVE	21	CHOWDHURY, RAIHAN KABIR	1211 S GLENDORA AVE, WEST COVINA, CA 91790-4925	STONE LIQUOR
45	ACTIVE	20	7 ELEVEN INC	711 N AZUSA AVE UNIT A, WEST COVINA, CA 91791-1011	7-ELEVEN STORE 38590A

*City of West Covina*  
**A G E N D A**

**ITEM NO. 4. a.**

**DATE: September 22, 2020**

**TO:** Planning Commission  
**FROM:** Planning Division  
**SUBJECT:** Forthcoming - October 13, 2020

---

**Attachments**

Forthcoming - 10.13.20

---



AGENDA NO. 4. a.

DATE: September 22, 2020

**FORTHCOMING PLANNING COMMISSION HEARING**

**October 13, 2020**

A. CONSENT CALENDAR

None

B. PUBLIC HEARINGS

(1)

PRECISE PLAN NO. 20-05

403 SPACE PARKING LOT FOR QUEEN OF THE VALLEY HOSPITAL

APPLICANT: Emanate Health

LOCATION: 1115 South Sunset Avenue

C. NON-HEARING ITEMS

None

**October 27, 2020**

A. CONSENT CALENDAR

None

B. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None

C. NON-HEARING ITEMS

None

*City of West Covina*  
**A G E N D A**

**ITEM NO. 4. b.**

**DATE: September 22, 2020**

**TO:** Planning Commission

**FROM:** Planning Division

**SUBJECT:** Subcommittee for Design Review Minutes - July 14, 2020 and August 25, 2020

---

**Attachments**

Subcommittee Minutes 7.14.20

Subcommittee Minutes 8.25.20

---

**WEST COVINA PLANNING COMMISSION  
SUBCOMMITTEE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD  
PLANNING CONFERENCE ROOM – ROOM 208  
REGULAR MEETING  
Tuesday, July 14, 2020  
6:30 p.m.**

***MINUTES***

**1. ROLL CALL** - Commissioners Jaquez and Redholtz were present.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES** – June 24, 2020

Motion by Commissioner Redholtz, seconded by Commissioner Jaquez; Approved 2-0.

**3. OTHER MATTERS OR ORAL COMMUNICATIONS**

**4. REVIEW ITEMS** – The agenda was re-ordered and item (C) was heard first.

(A)    **APPLICANT:**            Juvenal Martinez  
         **LOCATION:**                2043 E Norma Avenue  
         **PROPOSAL:**              Subcommittee Design Review No. 20-17;  
                                              Conditional Use Permit No. 20-06;  
                                              The applicant is proposing to construct a 1,381 square foot  
                                              first floor addition, a 1,430 square foot second-story addition  
                                              and a 24 square foot entry porch to the existing single-story  
                                              residence.

Both Commissioners Redholtz and Jaquez thought that the size and design of the proposed two-story house is too large and would not be compatible with the single-story neighborhood.

Motion by Commissioner Redholtz seconded by Commissioner Jaquez to proceed with the Conditional Use Permit public hearing.

(B)    **APPLICANT:**            Andres Bobadilla  
         **LOCATION:**                104 Buckboard Circle  
         **PROPOSAL:**              Subcommittee Design Review No. 20-47;  
                                              The applicant is proposing to construct a 1,198 square foot  
                                              accessory dwelling unit located at the rear corner of the  
                                              existing single-family residence and a 343 square foot  
                                              attached storage with no interior access to the accessory  
                                              dwelling unit.

Motion by Commissioner Jaquez seconded by Commissioner Redholtz that the proposed addition is in accordance with the Subcommittee Design Review Board Guidelines.

(C)     APPLICANT:        Eleanor and Reynaldo Reyes  
         LOCATION:        304 S Lark Ellen  
         PROPOSAL:        Subcommittee Design Review No.20-24;  
                                 The applicant is proposing to convert an unpermitted 284  
                                 square foot patio into a family room.

Both Commissioner Redholtz and Jaquez felt that the design of the addition is not consistent with the scale and design of the existing house because the roof of the addition is higher than the rest of the house and the existing CMU wall that is proposed to remain negatively impacts the aesthetics of the home's front façade.

Ms. Eleanor Reyes, Property Owner, was present. Ms. Reyes asked the subcommittee to allow her to keep the existing roof line of the proposed addition because the additional cost to lower/revise the roof line would be a financial burden. Ms. Reyes stated that she is willing to remove the CMU wall if the subcommittee allows her to keep the roof as proposed.

Motion by Redholtz seconded by Jaquez recommending that the roof of the addition be lowered to match the height of the existing house and to remove the CMU wall so that the proposed addition would be consistent with the Subcommittee Design Review Board Guidelines. The applicant asked for the project to be forwarded to the Planning Commission without any changes. The project will be forwarded to the Planning Commission for review.

## **5.     ADJOURNMENT**

Adjourn at 7:30 p.m.

**WEST COVINA PLANNING COMMISSION  
SUBCOMMITTEE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD  
PLANNING CONFERENCE ROOM – ROOM 208  
REGULAR MEETING  
Tuesday, August 25, 2020  
6:30 p.m.**

***MINUTES***

**1. ROLL CALL** - Commissioners Kennedy and Redholtz were present.

**2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES** – July 14, 2020

Motion by Commissioner Redholtz, seconded by Commissioner Kennedy; Approved 2-0.

**3. OTHER MATTERS OR ORAL COMMUNICATIONS** - None

**4. REVIEW ITEMS**

(A)    **APPLICANT:**            Chen Kun Lee  
         **LOCATION:**             329 N Bromley Avenue  
         **PROPOSAL:**           Subcommittee Design Review No. 20-27;  
                                     The applicant is proposing to construct a 904 square foot rear addition with a 400 square foot attached patio, a 77 square foot front addition, and a 34 square foot entry porch to the existing single-story residence. The applicant is also proposing to construct a 700 square foot patio addition attached to the rear of the existing garage.

Motion by Commissioner Redholtz seconded by Commissioner Kennedy that the proposed addition is in accordance with the Subcommittee Design Review Board Guidelines.

(B)    **APPLICANT:**            Ji Li  
         **LOCATION:**             1140 Spring Meadow Drive  
         **PROPOSAL:**           Subcommittee Design Review No. 17-27;  
                                     The applicant is proposing to construct a 9,869 square-foot new two-story house with second-floor balconies/decks, a 798 square foot detached ADU, an 896 square foot detached 3-car garage, a 2,105 square foot recreational vehicle garage with a workshop, a series of retaining walls (8'-0" maximum height), and wood deck. The project requires approval of an administrative use permit (AUP) because the proposed house exceeds the maximum unit size by no more than 25%,

AGENDA NO. 4. b.

DATE: September 22, 2020

the project involves retaining walls higher than 4 feet, and the project involves 2<sup>nd</sup> floor balconies/decks. A second unit review (SUR) application was submitted for the ADU.

Motion by Commissioner Kennedy seconded by Commissioner Redholtz to proceed with the Administrative Use Permit to a public hearing.

**5. ADJOURNMENT**

Adjourn at 7:08 p.m.